

To: COUNCIL

Meeting Date: 12/5/2023

Subject: 23-323-CD: 415 Water Street South, Heritage Permit Application, Request to Alter a Designated Property

Submitted By: Joan Jylanne, Manager of Policy Planning

Prepared By: Jeremy Parsons, Senior Planner – Heritage

Report No.: 23-323-CD

File No.: R01.01

Wards Affected: Ward 6

RECOMMENDATION(S):

THAT Report 23-323-CD: 415 Water Street South, Heritage Permit Application, Request to Alter a Designated Property be received;

AND FURTHER THAT Council approve the Heritage Permit application for the proposed alterations to the property located at 415 Water Street South, as outlined in Report 23-323-CD, subject to the following conditions:

- 1) That the proposed replacement windows on the stone house include replicated sashes and frames (if original frames cannot be repaired) that match the historic profile, shape, dimensions, and six-over-six frame divisions in wood material and not vinyl or aluminum;
- 2) That the applicant submits a rendering of the proposed horizontal wood siding material for the replacement structure that matches the current colour and appearance of existing clapboard, to the satisfaction of Heritage Planning staff;
- 3) That the applicant provides updated quotes with all specifications, to the satisfaction of Heritage Planning staff, for new wood windows on the stone house.
- 4) That the wood material from the existing frame addition and both the 19th century and 20th century wood windows on both the stone house and frame addition be carefully removed intact and made available to a list of salvage companies for reuse or donation;

- 5) That the structural linkage between the existing stone house and the proposed replacement frame addition only make use of existing window and door openings and that no further cut-outs into the stone masonry be carried out;
- 6) Following Council approval, that any minor changes to the plans and elevations shall be submitted to the satisfaction of the Chief Planner, prior to submission as part of any application for a building permit and/or the commencement of any alterations; and,
- 7) That the implementation of alterations, in accordance with this approval, shall be completed no later than two (2) years following Council approval. If the alterations are not completed by two (2) years following Council approval, then this approval expires as of that date and no alterations shall be undertaken without a new approval issued by the City of Cambridge.

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY:

Purpose

This report has been prepared to recommend approval on a Heritage Permit application for alterations proposed to the property located at 415 Water Street South, a property designated under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act.

Key Findings

- An HIA was submitted by Archaeological Research Associates Ltd. to the City of Cambridge on October 6, 2023.
- A Heritage Permit application was submitted to the City of Cambridge on October 19, 2023 (Appendix A).
- The property is designated under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act through Designation By-law No. 55-16.
- The Municipal Heritage Advisory Committee (MHAC) supported Heritage Planning staff's recommendations within Report 23-026 (MHAC) at its meeting on November 16, 2023.
- Heritage Planning staff support the Heritage Permit application, subject to several conditions, including salvaging existing wood windows and material from the existing frame addition and providing updated quotes for the proposed alterations.

Financial Implications

The owner is responsible for the cost of any approved alterations. There are no financial implications to the City as a result of this application.

STRATEGIC ALIGNMENT:

- Strategic Action; or
- Core Service

Objective(s): Not Applicable

Strategic Action: Not Applicable

Program: Community Development

Core Service: Heritage Conservation

BACKGROUND:

The subject property is located on the east side of Water Street South, approximately 350 metres east of the Grand River and Moffatt's Creek (Figure 1). The property is just over one acre in size (4,356 m²) and is surrounded by new residential development to the east and south and a large church property to the north. The property is currently in the process of being redeveloped. There are two phases to the site's redevelopment: the first phase involved both Official Plan and Zoning By-law Amendments to enable the construction of a two-storey mixed-use building at the rear of the property that was the subject of an earlier HIA (Amy Barnes Consulting, 2016). The second phase of the redevelopment is the subject of this revised HIA and involves modifications to the existing stone house, a former single-detached residence, to accommodate new uses.

The property is currently zoned Commercial (CS5) within the City's Zoning By-law. In 2018, By-law No. 66-18 was passed, pursuant to Section 34(18) of the Planning Act, amending the Zoning By-law to allow for commercial uses on this property and to allow for a maximum gross leasable commercial floor area of 575 m². Residential uses also continue to be permitted on this property in accordance with Section 3.3.3.1 of the Zoning By-law.

The property contains a one-and-a-half storey rough-cut limestone house on a rise of a hill facing north on Water Street South. The property also has a frame addition that was used as a summer kitchen and garage. The dwelling was constructed circa 1841 by David Potter in the Georgian architectural style. The historical front of the building, facing south, contains five bays; two prominent dormers; and a central front door with a transom, large lintel and fanlight window. The historical rear of the building, now the

front facing the parking lot, contains a three-bay façade with a pedimented vestibule and a central dormer. Two rectangular chimneys are located on each end of the gabled roof (Figures 2 and 3). The property was designated under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act in 2016 and is protected under By-law No. 55-16 (Appendix B).

The applicant is proposing to make alterations to the designated stone house by removing the existing summer kitchen and garage frame addition, replacing it with a new addition, replacing existing windows on the stone house, and replacing both existing doors, including the entrance vestibule (Appendix A, Figures 4 and 5). No Building Permits have yet been submitted in connection with the proposed alterations.



Figure 1: Aerial image of the subject property outlined in red (City of Cambridge)



Figure 2: Looking south at the subject property (City of Cambridge, 2023)



Figure 3: Looking north at the large frame addition with a wall of wood windows (City of Cambridge, 2023).



Figures 4 and 5: Renderings of the proposed replacement addition, submitted by the applicant, showing the northern and southern elevations (GB Architect Inc, 2023).

EXISTING POLICY / BY-LAW(S):

Ontario Heritage Act (R.S.O. 1990, c. O.18)

Alteration of property

33 (1) No owner of property designated under section 29 shall alter the property or permit the alteration of the property if the alteration is likely to affect the property's heritage attributes, as set out in the description of the property's heritage attributes in the by-law that was required to be registered under clause 29 (12) (b) or subsection 29 (19), as the case may be, unless the owner applies to the council of the municipality in which the property is situate and receives consent in writing to the alteration. 2019, c. 9, Sched. 11, s. 11.

Application

(2) An application under subsection (1) shall be accompanied by the prescribed information and material. 2019, c. 9, Sched. 11, s. 11.

Other information

(3) A council may require that an applicant provide any other information or material that the council considers it may need. 2019, c. 9, Sched. 11, s. 11.

Notice of complete application

(4) The council shall, upon receiving all information and material required under subsections (2) and (3), if any, serve a notice on the applicant informing the applicant that the application is complete. 2019, c. 9, Sched. 11, s. 11.

Notification re completeness of application

(5) The council may, at any time, notify the applicant of the information and material required under subsection (2) or (3) that has been provided, if any, and any information and material under those sections that has not been provided. 2019, c.9, Sch. 11, s. 11.

City of Cambridge Official Plan (2018)

4.6 Designation of Heritage Properties

1. The City will regulate as fully as possible the demolition, removal or inappropriate alteration of buildings of cultural heritage value or interest included in the Register of Cultural Heritage Resources referred to in Section 4.3, and for these purposes, Council may:

- a) pass by-laws pursuant to the Ontario Heritage Act to designate properties including such buildings or structures to be of cultural heritage value. Council shall not permit the demolition, removal or inappropriate alteration of such buildings or structures for a period of 90 days following application by the owner of such buildings or structures, or such further period of time as Council and the owner may agree upon, unless Council has repealed the by-law designating such property or part thereof.

ANALYSIS:

The proposal involves a series of alterations to the property located at 415 Water Street South including replacing the existing frame addition, replacing existing windows and doors, and reframing the front vestibule. Heritage Planning staff have worked with the applicant to submit and update their HIA and to refine their proposal to ensure that it would be supportable. Conditional support is recommended, provided that the applicant can satisfy compliance with the conditions outlined in this report.

Removal and Replacement of Summer Kitchen and Garage

The applicant is proposing to demolish the existing summer kitchen and garage which extends from the eastern elevation of the stone house. According to the HIA [found attached to Report 23-026 (MHAC)], this frame addition dates to the 19th century and may have been built around the time of construction of the circa 1841 stone house. According to the Windows Inspection and Assessment Report completed by Furlan Conservation (located within the HIA), there are five historic windows that date to the mid-19th century located on this frame structure. The construction details, light pattern, sashes, and glass texture are all typical of this period. No period hardware is present on these windows. The summer kitchen and garage are both indicated as heritage attributes within Designation By-law No. 55-16 (Appendix B).

The structural condition report completed by Centric Engineering in 2022 [found attached to Report 23-026 (MHAC)], reviewed the condition of the wood-frame addition and concluded that, in its current condition, the building does not appear to be suitable to be used for residential or commercial purposes. The report notes that the structural wood frame appears to be compromised in several areas and the lack of frost protection for the foundation makes it possible for the building to shift due to frost heave. Centric also noted that it may be unfeasible to underpin the foundation to provide frost protection without causing further damage to the wood frame.

As such, Heritage Planning staff are willing to support the replacement of the frame addition to accommodate a more stable and secure structure provided that the existing wood material (posts and beams) and existing windows can be carefully salvaged for reuse or donation. Heritage Planning staff are satisfied that the proposed design of the

new structure will echo the existing structure and will match the massing, height, and style over the same footprint. The proposed cladding material is prefinished horizontal wood siding that should match the colour and appearance of the current siding. The proposed replacement structure will have French-style doors and a single rectangular window on the north elevation. It will generally reproduce the layout and design of the existing 19th century frame structure.

Replacement of Wood Windows on Stone House

The applicant is proposing to remove and replace fifteen (15) wood windows on the 19th century stone house. These elements are identified as heritage attributes within the property's designation by-law (Appendix B). According to Furlan Conservation, there is a combination of double-hung wood sash windows and casement sash windows on the stone house. There is also a fanlight and transom over the door on the south elevation. The fanlight window will not be replaced. Both the fanlight and the transom window over the south elevation door appear to be original to the structure.

The six-over-six wooden sash windows present across the first and second elevations are, according to Furlan Conservation, all 20th century replacement windows. This is evidenced by the fact that they contain counterweighted spiral tube balances, a technology that was introduced around 1948. The upper casement windows within the dormers are also likely mid-20th century. Finally, exterior windows all have cast cement sills, a material that was not used in residential construction until the 20th century.

These wooden sash windows are proposed to be replaced with wood windows that match the historic profile, shape, and dimensions of the existing windows, all in wood material. Given the fact that the existing wood windows are of 20th century vintage and most have some level of damage or vandalism, Heritage Planning staff are in support of their replacement with an appropriate product. Heritage Planning staff do not support replacing these wood windows with vinyl, vinyl-clad, or aluminum-clad windows.

Other alterations

Other alterations proposed in this Heritage Permit application include the replacement of the pedimented wooden vestibule on the north elevation and the replacement of doors on both north and south elevations. The vestibule structure is proposed to be reframed in the same style, size, and overall massing, on the same footprint. The vestibule is identified as a heritage feature within the designation by-law. It is assumed that the structure is not original to the building and has been added on at a later date. Both doors are proposed to be replaced with modern products. The south elevation door is proposed to be constructed in steel or fibreglass with a wood grain finish.

Repainting is also noted within the HIA as being anticipated to be carried out in some point in the future on the stone house. Heritage Planning staff have not received a

Heritage Permit application for repointing nor have we received any quotes from contractors for repointing work. Any proposed repointing or other masonry work would require a separate application under the Ontario Heritage Act.

Heritage Planning staff are in support of the proposed Heritage Permit and have included several conditions in this report in order to ensure that the alterations are appropriate and respectful of the building's historic material and heritage character. These include requiring that the replacement wood windows replicate existing specifications; submission of a rendering to show the material proposed for the replacement frame addition; submission of updated quotes; salvage of wood material and windows; and the structural linkage between the stone house and the new addition not negatively impact the stone masonry. The recommendations and recommended conditions of this Report 23-323-CD are slightly different than the recommendations of Report 23-026 (MHAC) given that Council is not required to review or endorse the HIA and given that the applicant has submitted quotes for replacement doors and new windows on the new addition. As such, those elements were removed.

FINANCIAL IMPACT:

The owner is responsible for the cost of any approved alterations.

PUBLIC VALUE:

Conserving heritage properties supports the principles of sustainability and transparency (Five Public Value Principles).

Sustainability:

This project will support sustainability by retaining an existing heritage-designated structure in situ.

Transparency:

Council reports are posted publicly as part of the report process and Council meetings are open to the public.

ADVISORY COMMITTEE INPUT:

Heritage Planning staff consulted with the MHAC on November 16, 2023 through Report 23-026 (MHAC) and the Committee supported staff's recommendation to Council:

THAT Report 23-026 (MHAC): 415 Water Street South: Heritage Permit Application, Request to Alter a Designated Property be received;

AND THAT the Heritage Impact Assessment (HIA) submitted and included with the heritage permit application be received;

AND FURTHER THAT the Municipal Heritage Advisory Committee recommend that Council approve the Heritage Permit application for the proposed alterations to 415 Water Street South, as outlined in Report 23-026 (MHAC), subject to the following conditions:

- 1) That the proposed replacement windows on the stone house include replicated sashes and frames (if original frames cannot be repaired) that match the historic profile, shape, dimensions, and six-over-six frame divisions in wood material and not vinyl or aluminum;
- 2) That the applicant submits a rendering of the proposed horizontal wood siding material for the replacement structure that matches the current colour and appearance of existing clapboard, to the satisfaction of Heritage Planning staff;
- 3) That the applicant provides updated quotes with all specifications, to the satisfaction of Heritage Planning staff, for new wood windows on the stone house, replacement doors on the stone house, and new windows on the replacement frame addition;
- 4) That the wood material from the existing frame addition and both the 19th century and 20th century wood windows on both the stone house and frame addition be carefully removed intact and made available to a list of salvage companies for reuse or donation;
- 5) That the structural linkage between the existing stone house and the proposed replacement frame addition only make use of existing window and door openings and that no further cut-outs into the stone masonry be carried out;
- 6) Following Council approval, that any minor changes to the plans and elevations shall be submitted to the satisfaction of the Chief Planner, prior to submission as part of any application for a building permit and/or the commencement of any alterations; and,
- 7) That the implementation of alterations, in accordance with this approval, shall be completed no later than two (2) years following Council approval. If the alterations are not completed by two (2) years following Council approval, then this approval expires as of that date and no alterations shall be undertaken without a new approval issued by the City of Cambridge.

PUBLIC INPUT:

Posted publicly as part of the report process.

INTERNAL / EXTERNAL CONSULTATION:

Heritage planning staff liaised with the property owner on the proposal and the process of applying for a Heritage Permit.

CONCLUSION:

For the reasons outlined in this report, Heritage Planning staff recommend that Council approve the Heritage Permit application requesting to alter the designated property, subject to the conditions outlined in this report.

REPORT IMPACTS:

Agreement: **No**

By-law: **No**

Budget Amendment: **No**

Policy: **No**

APPROVALS:

This report has gone through the appropriate workflow and has been reviewed and or approved by the following as required:

Director

Deputy City Manager

Chief Financial Officer

City Solicitor

City Manager

ATTACHMENTS:

1. 23-323-CD Appendix A: Heritage Permit Application
2. 23-323-CD Appendix B: Designation By-law No. 55-16